



The Students' Motivation in Online Learning Environment

Munir

Universitas Negeri Makassar

munir@unm.ac.id

Amra Aryani Universitas

Negeri Makassar

amra_aryani@unm.ac.id

Reski Mulia

Universitas Negeri Makassar

reski_mulia@gmail.com

Corresponding email: munir@unm.ac.id

Abstract

This research aims to identify the students' motivation in learning in online learning environment. The researcher used qualitative methods. To achieve the research objectives, the data collected was in the form of in-depth interviews. The subjects of this research were students of grade 11 SMAN 18 Bulukumba. The interview samples were 13 students with a snowball sampling technique. Based on the research, the researchers found about student learning motivation in online learning environment, data obtained showed that learning motivation were intrinsic factor and extrinsic factor. The intrinsic factor was that some students have an interest in the online learning environment, while the extrinsic factor, some students do not see because of external factors, namely an unpleasant environment, some students also do not have gadgets, and students do not understand the platform used by the teacher and the limitations of the internet. From the problems that the researcher found, it is expected that teacher or school, form several groups, to provide facilities for these electronic devices during the learning process.

Keywords: Online Learning Environment, Student Motivation.

Introduction,

Motivation plays an important role in the process of online teaching and learning. The success of online education is contingent upon the students' motivation. This can motivate kids to pursue educational ambitions. As a result, motivation is critical to the teaching and learning process's success. Without motivation, achieving learning objectives is difficult. Students that are motivated will engage enthusiastically in the teaching and learning process, which will motivate them to learn English well. Given the critical nature of motivation in online learning, various motivational challenges arise when studying English online.

Motivation is defined as a 'theoretical construct that helps to explain the commencement, direction, intensity, persistence, and quality of activity, particularly goal-directed conduct' (Brophy, 2010). It is related to the cognitive and affective processes of individuals in situated and interactive interactions between learners and their learning environment in response to contextual and social elements that function as enablers or barriers (Schuck 2014).

According to Brown (2007), "Motivation, like self, can be global, situational, or task-oriented." Typically, motivation is analyzed in terms of the learner's intrinsic and extrinsic motivations. Intrinsic motivation, on the other hand, emerges when learners acquire knowledge in order to meet their own perceived wants and goals. Whereas those who work extrinsically accept exogenous imbalances created by others who pursue goals.

In some aspects, the "needs" idea of motivation is shared by all three schools of thinking. Fulfilling needs is pleasurable, requires decisions, and must frequently be interpreted in a social context. For example, children who are motivated to learn to read do so to satisfy their needs for exploration, stimulation, knowledge, self-esteem, and autonomy, and they do so in a variety of methods and schedules and within the context of a culture that values literacy. On the other hand, children may be unmotivated to learn because they do not perceive a benefit and instead associate learning with surface necessities such as meeting a requirement.

Motivation, which Paris and Turner (1994) refer to as 'machine learning,' determines what, how, and when learners learn (Schunk & Usher, 2012). Ryan and Deci (2000) suggest in their study that self-reliant learners are capable of engaging in difficult learning tasks that require them to actively seek out appropriate ways to support their learning, enjoy it, and display more conscientious, creative, and effective learning. Sardiman (2014) asserts that motivation is a shift in a person's energy that is fueled by a "feeling" plan and preceded by a response to a goal. Students are motivated in two ways, namely intrinsic motivation and extrinsic motivation. Intrinsic motivation is motivation that comes from the individual or oneself, while extrinsic motivation is motivation that comes from outside.

As Deci and Ryan (1985) demonstrate, intrinsic motivation encompasses the following: (1) motivation to learn and acquire new knowledge, such as happiness associated with learning new things; (2) motivation to experience physical encouragement and excitement, such as pleasure associated with learning interesting learning material; and (3) motivation to engage in challenging learning activities, such as completing difficult assignments. Interests, ambitions, aspirations, awareness, competency, and physical and psychological factors all influence intrinsic motivation. Extrinsic motivation, on the other hand, is associated with (3) motivation to be rewarded or avoid punishment (external regulation), such as wanting to earn a good grade for completing a difficult project; (3) motivation to avoid negative situations or feelings of guilt (introduced regulation), such as demonstrating his capabilities to accomplish complex tasks; and (3) motivation to obtain benefits and needs after accomplishing a learning activity (identified rules), such as proving his ability to perform heavy tasks (Erten, 2014). Extrinsic motivation is influenced by the learning environment, social environment, family environment, and supportive environment.

Sardiman (2014) contends that motivation serves three purposes:

- a) Inspire people to act, for example, by acting as a mover or motor that generates energy. Motivation is the driving factor behind all of the activities that will be undertaken in this scenario.
- b) Establishing the course of action, or the direction toward the desired outcome, such motivations can provide guidance and actions that must be carried out in accordance with its objectives.
- c) Choosing the action, which decides which acts should be carried out in a coordinated manner to accomplish the goal, while excluding those that are detrimental to the aim.

Motivation is critical when it comes to language learning. "When we learn our first language," Pinter (2006) observed, "it is all a normal part of growing up." Individuals who learn a new language do so out of a desire to integrate into their new community. Marianne Nikolov, a Hungarian teacher, trainer, and researcher, conducted an interesting study in 1999. She discovered that as children grow older, they typically draw on different sources of incentive to learn English. Some of the youngsters are intrinsically motivated, which means they desire to learn English for the sake of learning.

Instrumental motivation is often defined as the desire to derive practical benefits from language study (Hudson, 2000). This is believed to be the aim of second language learning when the student is uninterested in social interaction with current target languages community members. "Instrumental motivation refers to the perceived pragmatic benefits of L2 proficiency and reflects the recognition that for many language learners it is the usefulness of L2 proficiency that provides the greatest driving force to learn language. It subsumes such utilitarian goals as receiving a better job or a higher salary as a consequence of mastering L2" (Dornyei 2006).

The purpose of this study is to determine the level of students' intrinsic and extrinsic motivation towards the English learning process. Motivation originates within an individual, not from external or external rewards such as money or value. Intrinsically motivated individuals derive enjoyment from the activity itself or from their satisfaction with finishing or even performing a task. (Ryan 2005) says that intrinsic motivation is the desire to engage in an activity for its inherent enjoyment rather than for some of the secondary benefits. When an individual is intrinsically motivated, he or she acts out of pleasure or challenge rather than in response to external encouragement, pressure, or reward. Along with language capacity, motivation is considered a critical factor in determining success when learning a new language in the classroom. Teachers can ascertain students' interest in studying

English by determining their motivation. They can do so by enhancing the quality of their instruction. Each student is enthusiastic to learn English. The author sought to ascertain the students' motivation for learning English in this study.

The environment plays an important role in the development of human behavior, especially the school environment. Because from the school environment, students are expected to change their behavior as expected. Schools with a supportive environment for educational success will directly and indirectly have a positive impact on changing student behavior. In addition to providing behavioral changes, a good school environment will increase student learning motivation (Djamarah, 2010:95).

The online learning environment is a component of the learning process that enables students to accomplish learning objectives through the use of virtual media, where the environment has an effect on teaching and learning activities (Winarno, 2012). The online learning environment encompasses all of the factors in our world that influence human behavior, growth, development, and life processes in specific ways. A virtual learning environment in which teachers and students are physically separated by space. This type of environment is typically housed within a learning management system (LMS) framework, which includes not only areas for learners to deposit information, but also additional instructional tools such as assignment submission and assessment areas, grade interface, chat sessions, small group areas, and in-course private mail. Additionally, many online learning environments include plug-in social learning resources such as video conferencing. This context may be synchronous, asynchronous, or a combination of both. Hasbullah (2015) said that the online learning environment is divided into three types, namely:

- 1) Family environment, this family environment is the environment first and foremost for children who support successful online learning.
- 2) School environment, this school environment is the second environment after the educational environment.
- 3) Community environment, after receiving education in the environment family, community environment is the third environment in child education.

In online learning, the learning environment also plays an important role in increasing student motivation in learning. According Purwanto, (2004) the online learning environment is a place and situation of interaction between the students and teacher in online learning. A good learning environment can be stimulating to study. On the other hand, an uncomfortable environment will cause disturbance in study concentration. So, every learning environment is expected to have a good and calm environment in order to support the implementation of the process of good learning. Fulfillment of learning facilities such as infrastructure in learning and the existence of a good learning environment can support the learning process so that activities take place effectively and efficiently. Interaction between teacher and students is an activity that dominates in the learning process teaching in schools. Success in the process of interaction between teachers with students in the learning process teaching not only depends on the method or method used in teaching, but other components also influence success in learning interactions. In teaching, all of these things can be included in a good learning environment.

In addition to the school environment, online learning media facilities are another factor that supports the student learning process. LMS that connects media platforms in online learning is everything that is important in the online learning process to support teaching and learning activities and facilitate the implementation of learning. Mixed synchronous and asynchronous collaborative online learning platform media tools such as classroom are very important in the learning process for teaching and can also arouse students' interest and attention to facilitate the delivery of learning materials (Arikunto, 2009:6).

In this research the researcher will used and focused on tools for learning in the element of online learning environment because this researcher will be used asynchronous and synchronous tools. Then, students are now doing online learning using applications in the learning process and through that, the researcher wants to know student's motivation in online learning environment.

Based on the explanation above, the support of a conducive learning environment served as a support for the creation of an effective teaching and learning process, so that learning becomes more significant and enjoyable.

The above explanation can be concluded that this study wants to focus on finding out how the motivation of students, especially in the school environment, in using application media tools for online learning in the teaching and learning process in English class.

Research Methodology,**1. Research Design**

The researcher observed the phenomena that occurred so that they can be classified as qualitative research. SMAN 18 Bulukumba was the object of the study so that it requires the researcher to go directly and conduct research on phenomena and issues at SMAN 18 Bulukumba while taking data with a descriptive qualitative design.

2. Data Sources

This research was conducted at SMAN 18 Bulukumba in Bulukumba Regency. The subject was grade 11 SMA Negeri 18 Bulukumba, data Sources of this research were students in Senior High School 18 Bulukumba. The characteristics of students in grade 11 at SMA Negeri 18 Bulukumba were relatively the same, that their thoughts and emotions were more stable which were no longer in the transition phase.

Creswell (2014), snowball sampling is a sampling procedure in which the researcher asked participants to identify other participants to become members of the sample. The research was conducted in class XI SMAN 18 Bulukumba and the subject is class XI IPA 2 students who have difficulty in the online learning process environment. The data got is the experience of students in online learning environment. The researcher used online interviews to answer the research questions.

3. Research Instrument

After deciding to conduct an interview, the researcher choose which type of interview was best to help students understand key phenomena and answer research questions. The interview technique used by the researcher depends on the accessibility of the participants, the cost, and the amount of time required (Creswell, 2014). One-on-one interviews are a data collection method in which the researcher asks questions and records the responses of only one study participant at a time. One-on-one interviews are good for interviewing participants who are confident in their ability to communicate, be fluent, and share thoughts at ease. The research used interviews as the instruments of this research. The number of questions that were used in this research is 13 questions regarding students' motivation in online learning environment. The researcher used online interviews for this research because all information could be obtained clearly and all misunderstandings could be avoided.

Findings**Intrinsic Motivation**

These motivations can be formed from internal factors is motivation to learn and acquire new knowledge, motivation to experience physical encouragement and excitement, and motivation to engage in challenging learning activities involves the students' interest, regarding student's motivation in online learning environment, some data were obtained as follows:

a. Motivation to learn and acquire new knowledge

Learning by using internet in the form of videos or via Zoom is a new thing to do during this covid 19 pandemic. Of course, there are some convenient things that students get, one of which is getting new experiences by using distance learning. because you can get a new experience through Zoom as happiness associated in different way from offline class.

(ZA,03/12/2021)

.....Through this online learning, I feel a new experience because the learning is done from home using electronic devices, so I get a new experience of modern learning, and get sources that get lots of different materials than usual when learning in class.

b. Motivation to experience physical encouragement and excitement

Distance learning using the internet is indeed required during the pandemic because it follows health protocols. The government prohibits gatherings that can cause the spread of the covid 19 virus. So that the learning environment for students and teachers lies in the environment when the learning

place and the environment are on the internet media. So that this becomes something very interesting because learning is done using interesting media as well.

(YP,03/12/2021)

.....Distance learning using the internet is indeed required during the pandemic because it follows health protocols. The government prohibits gatherings that can cause the spread of the covid 19 virus. So that the learning environment for students and teachers lies in the environment when the learning place and the environment are on the internet media. So that this becomes something very interesting because learning is done using interesting media as well.

c. Motivation to engage in challenging learning activities

Learning English is a necessary learning with complex abilities because the skills learned in English consist of several skills, namely speaking reading writing and listening using internet media distance learning students can develop the four skills easily from several sources that can be easily accessed. obtained via the internet

(YP,03/12/2021)

.....Usually I am bored and do not understand in learning English when in class, but if distance learning using the internet, I can find out a lot of vocabulary, can look on Google, and can browse various sources. So that I can solve the difficulties that are usually faced especially in vocabulary and that makes me very happy to learn English.

1. Extrinsic Motivation

a. Get Rewarded

Learning motivation has a big role in a person's success in learning. Based on this description, it can be concluded that the notion of learning motivation is the overall driving force or encouragement in students to carry out learning activities marked by changes in energy to achieve the desired goals. Students must be consciously aware of the activities and learning needs to achieve goals (the ideals to be achieved). The goal is in the form of good grades and getting rewards. Prizes can also be regarded as motivation for students. Both the prizes come from schools to students who excel, or from parents or family.

b. Demonstrate Capabilities

Some students are enthusiastic in learning if they can and understand the lessons learned, so that students are motivated to express their abilities in the material. Both orally and in writing. If they can demonstrate their ability in English material well, they will be more enthusiastic about learning. For example, in speaking, the student will automatically be enthusiastic to practice speaking in English. This can make its own motivation for students.

c. Obtain Benefits

The more you know the graph of learning outcomes, the more motivated the students are to keep learning, with an expectation that the results will continue to increase. The planning of goals that are recognized and accepted by students will be an important motivation. Because by understanding the goals that must be achieved, it will be felt very useful and profitable, so that motivation will arise to continue learning.

2. The Problems Faced by Students in Online Learning Environment Using Platform Media Applications

a. Limited time

Learning time is of course limited. In carrying out learning such as teachers, it is difficult to explain the material, giving examples, then giving an approach to students, because they do not meet face to face so this is a shortcoming that occurs when doing pandemic learning.

b. Lack Interaction

The implementation of the learning process here runs smoothly and effectively when there is a positive interaction between teachers and students, interaction here and here is feedback or can be referred to as a form of appreciation.

(SW,03/12/2021

)

.....The teacher used to remind him to be diligent in learning English, understand the meaning and make examples to study previously that the teacher had given him.

c. Difficult network

This is an obstacle for parents or students participating in online learning. On the other hand, even though they already use a wi-fi network, rural communities often have network difficulties and network difficulties that cause learning to be disrupted and even the network can be disconnected and cannot follow lessons. Such as data from interviews as follows:

(NN,03/12/2021

)

.....The obstacle is the difficult internet network. the application also usually has trouble in use. The application also usually cannot be used because it has expired.

Discussion

The result of motivation can be formed from internal factors is motivation to learn and acquire new knowledge, motivation to experience. From the results of interviews with students, it is known that the level of student motivation towards the online learning environment process in English lessons through Google classroom and zoom, namely there are two opinions related to motivation coming from the intrinsic and extrinsic motivation of students in online learning. This can be seen from the interview questions, namely students' motivation in understanding material related to the learning environment, understanding interesting material, and students' motivation during the online learning process for English lessons. Physical encouragement and excitement, and motivation to engage in challenging learning activities involve the students' interest, regarding student's motivation in online learning environment.

For this reason, it is necessary to have a common teaching method in the teaching and learning process in the classroom, including: 1) Teaching Method is defined as the process of delivering information by way of explaining or telling a group of material orally and at the same time the material is received by a group of subjects. 2) Discussion Method is defined as a process of delivering material, in which the teacher and the subject of students hold a joint dialogue to find solutions and absorbents and analyze one or a group of certain materials. 3) The Assignment Method is defined as additional material that must be met by students, both inside and outside the classroom. 4) Demonstration Method is very suitable to be applied in learning because students can see directly the process of something happening. The demonstration method is a way of teaching material by carrying out a practice of a

process to students, presenting the object being studied, both real and artificial objects with verbal explanations. 5) Question and Answer Method is the process of delivering the teacher to ask questions and students answer it and vice versa. This method has advantages and disadvantages, so the teacher must adjust the lesson material with the question and answer method.

Conclusion and Suggestions

Based on interviews that have been conducted by researcher with several students at SMA Negeri 18 Bulukumba, regarding students' motivation in online learning environment, data can be found that students' motivation is influenced by two factors, namely intrinsic and extrinsic. The intrinsic factor is that some students are motivated and have an interest in learning in themselves towards learning in an online environment. while extrinsic factors, some students are not motivated due to external problems, namely, a less pleasant environment or atmosphere, some students also do not have gadgets, and students lack understanding about the platform used by teachers and internet limitations. From the problems found by the researcher, it is hoped that teachers or school form several groups to provide loan facilities for these electronic devices during the learning process.

In line with the conclusion above, the researcher provides suggestions for the teacher and students as follows:

The online learning, many students complain about the teacher's teaching methods. Therefore, teachers are expected to improve teaching methods during online learning so that students can learn optimally. It is expected that students will make more efforts to increase interest in learning even though learning is online. This research is only limited to student motivation in an online learning

environment. It is expected that further researchers can conduct further research using a more in-depth problem formulation related to the online learning process.

References

- A. M. Sardiman. (2014). *Interaksi dan Motivasi Belajar Mengajar*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers. Abu Ahmadi, *Learning Psychology*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta
- Amna Emda, "The Position of Student Motivation in Learning" *LantanidaJournal*, vol. 5 No. 2 (2017)
- Anderson, J.L. & Barnett, M. (2013). *Learning Physics with Digital Game Simulations in Middle School Science*. *J Sci Educ Technol*, 22(6), 914-926
- Anna Mieczakowski, Tanya Goldhaber, John Clarkson. "Culture, Communication and Change: Summary of an investigation of the use and impact of modern media and technology in our lives" (Cheshire: The Printing House Ltd 2011)
- Arsyad, Azhar. 2012. *Learning Media*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Jakarta
- Asmara, Anjar Purba. (2015). Development of audiovisual-based learning media about colloid making. *DIDAKTIKA Scientific Journal*, 15, 156-178.
- Baber, H. (2020). Determinants of students' perceived learning outcome and satisfaction in online learning during the pandemic of COVID-19. *Journal of Education and E-Learning Research*, 7(3), 285-292.
- Bahri D Syaiful and Aswan Zain. 2012. *Teaching and Learning Strategies*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Braus, J. A., & Wood, D. (2011). *Environmental education in the schools: creating a program that works*. Washington D.C: Peace Corps Information Collection and Exchange.
- Brown, H. Douglas. (2007). *Principles of Language Learning and Teaching 5Th Edition*. New York: Pearson Longman Inc.
- Buno, Hamzah. 2006. *New Orientation in Learning Psychology*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*.
- Dabbagh, Nada & Bannan-Ritland, Brenda. 2005. *Online learning, concepts, strategies, and application*. Upper Saddle River, N.J: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Dalyono, M. 2009. *Psikologi Pendidikan*. Jakarta. Rineka Cipta
- Daryanto. 2010. *Learning Media*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Jakarta.
- Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (1985). *Motivasi intrinsik dan penentuan nasib sendiri dalam perilaku manusia*. New York: Pleno.
- Dede Rosyada, *Democratic Education Paradigm*, (Jakarta: Kencana PernadaMedia Group, 2003)
- Dina Alfiana Ikhawani, *Effective Learning Strategies During the Covid-19 Pandemic*, (Jakarta: Media Sains Indonesia, 2021)
- Dornyei, A. et. al. (2006). The Effects of Al (III) Speciation on The Activity of Trypsin. *Journal of Inorganic Biochemistry*. 97: 118-123. Hudson, 2000
- Erwin. 2015. *Problems of students in class and their solutions*. Jakarta: PT. Rineka Cipta.
- Fachrurrozi, Aziz, Mahyuddin, Ertan. 2011. *Foreign Language Learning Techniques (contemporary and*

- traditional methods). Tangerang Main Scholar Library
- Firat, M and Kuzu, A (2011) Semantic Web For E-learning bottlenecks: Disorientation and Cognitive Overload International. Journal of Web & Semantic Technology (IJWeST) Vol.2, No.4, October 2011
- Firman, F., & Rahayu, S. (2020). Pembelajaran online di tengah pandemi covid- 19. Indonesian Journal of Educational Science (IJES), 2(2), 81-89.
- Fitriyani, Y., Fauzi, I., & Sari, M. Z. (2020). Motivasi belajar mahasiswa pada pembelajaran daring selama pandemik Covid-19. Jurnal Kependidikan: Jurnal Hasil Penelitian dan Kajian Kepustakaan di Bidang Pendidikan, Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran, 6(2), 165-175.
- Gardner, (1991). Fisiologi Tanaman Budidaya. Indonesia University Press, Jakarta. Guenther. 1952. The Essensial Oils. D. Van Norstrad Co.Inc. New York. 2nd ed. Vol. III. 552 -574.
- Gardner, Robert. (1985). Social psychology and second language learning: The Role of Attitude and Motivation. Lonodon: Edward Arnold.
- Gay, Mills, & Airasian (2012). Educational Research; Competencies for Analysis and Aplications.
- Gordon, MH. 1990. The Mechanism of Antioxidants Action in Vitro. Dalam B.J.F. Hudson, editor. Food Antioxidants. Elsevier Applied Science, London.
- Heitzman, S. (2010) "A Review of Tax Research". Journal of Accounting and Economics, 50, 127-178. Siregar, Eveline, Dra., M.Pd. dan Nara, Hartini M.Si. 2010. Teori Belajar dan Pembelajaran. Bogor: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Hidayat, D., & Noeraida, N. (2020). Pengalaman komunikasi siswa melakukan kelas online selama pandemi Covid – 19. JIKE: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi Efek, 3(2), 172- 182.
- Hrastinski, S. (2008). Synchronous & Asynchronous E-learning/Stefan Hrastinski. Educause Quarterly, 31(4).
- Kasihani K. E. Suyanto, English For Young Learning, (Jakarta: P.T Bumi Aksara,
- Khalil, R., Mansour, A. E., Fadda, W. A., Almisnid, K., Aldamegh, M., Al-Nafeesah, A., Alkhalifah, A., & Al-Wutayd, O. (2020). The sudden transition to synchronized online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic in Saudi Arabia: a qualitative study exploring medical students' perspective. BMC Medical Education 20(285).
- M Musfiquon, Development of Media and Learning Resources, (Jakarta: PT. Prestasi Pustakaraya,
- Miles, M. B., & Hubberman, A. (1994). Qualitative Data Analysis: an expanded sourcebook (2nd. Ed). London: SAGE.
- Nana Syaodih Sukmadinata. (2004). Landasan Psikologi Proses Pendidikan. Bandung: PT remaja Rosdakarya.: 164).
- Nikolov, Marianne. (1999). Language Teaching Research. Sage Journals. Vol.3 no. 1 33-56
- Pakpahan, R., & Fitriani, Y. (2020). Analisa pemanfaatan teknologi informasi dalam pembelajaran jarak jauh di tengah pandemi virus Corona Covid-19. Journal of Information System, Applied, Management, Accounting and Research, 4(2), 30–36.
- Porst, R. (2011). Fragebogen. Ein Arbeitsbuch. Wiesbaden: VS-Verlag.
- Rachmat, N. (2020). Analysis of effectiveness of online learning pandemic covid-19 in prosthetic orthotic major in Polkesta. Jurnal Terpadu Ilmu Kesehatan, 9(2), 117268.
- Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000a). Intrinsic and extrinsic motivations: Classic definitions and new

directions. Contemporary Educational

Sunarto, "Information and Communication Technology for SMP/MTs Class VII", (Jakarta: Grafindo, 2012)

Taylor, S. E. 2009. Health Psychology. 7th edition. New York: McGraw-Hill,

Tileston, D. W. (2010). What every teacher should know about student motivation. California: Corwin. Gardner dan Lambert (1972). Attitude and motivation in second language learning. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House.

Wina Sanjaya. 2005. Learning in Competency-Based Curriculum Implementation. Jakarta: Kencana Media Group

Winarno. 2012. Paradigma Baru Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan: Panduan Kuliah di Perguruan Tinggi. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.